



**Formal Negotiations on a  
New Cayman Islands Constitution**

**First Round**

---

**Between**

**The Cayman Islands Delegation**

**- and -**

**The United Kingdom Delegation**

---

**Monday, 29 September 2008 – Thursday, 2 October 2008**

**Held at**

**The Ritz-Carlton, Grand Cayman**

**The United Kingdom's Delegation**

Mr. Ian Hendry - The Chairman  
Ms. Susan Dickson - Legal Counsellor, Foreign and Commonwealth Office  
Mr. Michael Bradley - Constitutional Adviser, FCO Overseas Territories Directorate  
Ms. Helen Nellthorp - Deputy Head, FCO Overseas Territories Directorate  
Ms. Sarah Latham - Desk Officer, Cayman Islands FCO Overseas Territories

**The Cayman Islands Delegation**

His Excellency the Governor Mr. Stuart Jack  
Hon. Samuel Bulgin, QC, Attorney General

**Professor Jeffrey Jowell, QC** – Consultant to the Cayman Islands Government to assist in the Constitutional Modernisation Initiative

a National Negotiating Team comprising representatives of:

**The Elected Government**

Hon. D. Kurt Tibbetts, JP - Honourable Leader of Government Business, Minister of District Administration, Planning, Agriculture & Housing  
Hon. Alden M. McLaughlin, Jr. JP – Minister of Education, Training, Employment, Youth, Sports & Culture  
Hon. Anthony S. Eden, OBE, JP - Minister of Health & Human Services  
Hon. Charles E. Clifford, JP - Minister of Tourism, Environment, Development & Commerce  
Hon. V. Arden McLean, JP - Minister of Communications, Works & Infrastructure

**The Government Backbench**

Ms. Lucille D. Seymour, BEM  
Mr. Osbourne V. Bodden

Mr. W. Alfonso Wright  
Mr. Moses I. Kirkconnell, JP

**The Official Opposition**

Hon. W. McKeever Bush, OBE, JP, Honourable Leader of the Opposition  
Mr. Rolston M. Anglin  
Capt. A. Eugene Ebanks, JP

Mr. Cline A. Glidden, Jr.  
Ms. Juliana Y. O'Connor-Connolly, JP

Ms. Theresa Pitcairn-Lewis – UDP Legal Adviser

**The Cayman Ministers' Association** - Pastor Al Ebanks

**The Cayman Islands Conference of Seventh Day Adventists** - Pastor Shian O'Connor

**The Chamber of Commerce**

Mr. Will Pineau – CEO Chamber of Commerce  
Mr. Eddie Thompson, President Elect    Mr. Stuart Bostock, Vice President

**The Human Rights Committee**

Ms. Melanie McLaughlin, Chairperson HRC Constitutional Working Group  
Mrs. Sara Collins, Partner and Head of Specialist Trust Disputes Group

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

<b>PRAYER .....</b>	<b>1</b>
PASTOR SHIAN O’CONNOR .....	1
 <b>PROPOSAL 4 – BILL OF RIGHTS .....</b>	 <b>1</b>
PROFESSOR JEFFREY JOWELL, QC.....	2
MS. MELANIE MCLAUGHLIN.....	3
PASTOR AL EBANKS .....	4
HON. W. MCKEEVA BUSH .....	5
PASTOR AL EBANKS .....	8
PASTOR SHIAN O’CONNOR .....	9
MS. MELANIE MCLAUGHLIN.....	10
MR. CLINE A. GLIDDEN, JR. ....	11
 <b>DEFINITIONS .....</b>	 <b>11</b>
 <b>“GOVERNMENT” .....</b>	 <b>11</b>
PROFESSOR JEFFREY JOWELL, QC.....	13
 <b>“PUBLIC OFFICIAL”.....</b>	 <b>13</b>
PROFESSOR JEFFREY JOWELL, QC.....	14
PASTOR AL EBANKS .....	15
 <b>SECTION 2 .....</b>	 <b>15</b>
PROFESSOR JEFFREY JOWELL, QC.....	15
MS. JULIANNA Y. O’CONNOR-CONNOLLY .....	16
PROFESSOR JEFFREY JOWELL, QC.....	16
HON. ALDEN M. MCLAUGHLIN, JR. ....	17
 <b>SECTION 3 .....</b>	 <b>17</b>
HON. ALDEN M. MCLAUGHLIN, JR. ....	19
MS. JULIANNA Y. O’CONNOR-CONNOLLY .....	19
HON. ALDEN M. MCLAUGHLIN, JR. ....	20
 <b>SECTIONS 4 and 5.....</b>	 <b>21</b>
HON. V. ARDEN MCLEAN, JP.....	21
HON. ALDEN M. MCLAUGHLIN, JR. ....	22
HON. SAMUEL W. BULGIN, QC, JP .....	22
HON. V. ARDEN MCLEAN.....	22
HON. SAMUEL W. BULGIN, QC, JP .....	22
MS. JULIANNA Y. O’CONNOR-CONNOLLY .....	22
PROFESSOR JEFFREY JOWELL, QC.....	24
HON. W. MCKEEVA BUSH .....	25
PROFESSOR JEFFREY JOWELL, QC.....	25
MS. JULIANNA Y. O’CONNOR-CONNOLLY .....	26

HON. ALDEN M. MCLAUGHLIN, JR. ....	26
PROFESSOR JEFFREY JOWELL, QC.....	26
MS. JULIANNA Y. O’CONNOR-CONNOLLY .....	27
PROFESSOR JEFFREY JOWELL, QC.....	27
MS. JULIANNA Y. O’CONNOR-CONNOLLY .....	27
PROFESSOR JEFFREY JOWELL .....	28
MS. JULIANNA Y. O’CONNOR-CONNOLLY .....	28
PROFESSOR JEFFREY JOWELL, QC.....	28
MS. JULIANNA Y. O’CONNOR-CONNOLLY .....	28
PROFESSOR JEFFREY JOWELL, QC.....	28
MS. JULIANNA Y. O’CONNOR-CONNOLLY .....	29
HON. ALDEN M. MCLAUGHLIN, JR. ....	29
MS. JULIANNA Y. O’CONNOR-CONNOLLY .....	30
HON. ALDEN M. MCLAUGHLIN, JR. ....	30
PROFESSOR JEFFREY JOWELL, QC.....	30
MS. JULIANNA Y. O’CONNOR-CONNOLLY, JP .....	30
PROFESSOR JEFFREY JOWELL, QC.....	31
HON. D. KURT TIBBETTS.....	31
MS. JULIANNA Y. O’CONNOR-CONNOLLY .....	32
PROFESSOR JEFFREY JOWELL, QC.....	32
PASTOR SHIAN O’CONNOR .....	33
HON. ALDEN M. MCLAUGHLIN, JR. ....	33
MS. JULIANNA Y. O’CONNOR-CONNOLLY, JP .....	34
PASTOR SHIAN O’CONNOR .....	34
MS. MELANIE MCLAUGHLIN.....	34
PROFESSOR JEFFREY JOWELL, QC.....	35
HON. SAMUEL W. BULGIN, QC .....	35
MS. MELANIE MCLAUGHLIN.....	35
<b>SECTION 6 .....</b>	<b>36</b>
MS. JULIANNA Y. O’CONNOR-CONNOLLY .....	36
HON. SAMUEL W. BULGIN, QC .....	36
HON. ALDEN M. MCLAUGHLIN, JR. ....	37
HON. D. KURT TIBBETTS, JP .....	37
HON. SAMUEL W. BULGIN, QC .....	37
HON. W. MCKEEVA BUSH .....	38
HON. ALDEN M. MCLAUGHLIN, JR. ....	39
HON. W. MCKEEVA BUSH .....	39
HON. D. KURT TIBBETTS.....	40
<b>SECTION 12 .....</b>	<b>40</b>
HON. D. KURT TIBBETTS.....	40
HON. ALDEN M. MCLAUGHLIN, JR. ....	41
<b>SECTION 15 .....</b>	<b>42</b>
PROFESSOR JEFFREY JOWELL, QC.....	42

MS. MELANIE MCLAUGHLIN.....	43
PASTOR SHIAN O’CONNOR.....	43
MS. MELANIE MCLAUGHLIN.....	43
HON. ALDEN M. MCLAUGHLIN, JR. ....	44
MS. MELANIE MCLAUGHLIN.....	44
HON. ALDEN M. MCLAUGHLIN, JR. ....	45
PASTOR SHIAN O’CONNOR.....	45
HON. ALDEN M. MCLAUGHLIN, JR. ....	45
PASTOR SHIAN O’CONNOR.....	45
HON. ALDEN M. MCLAUGHLIN, JR. ....	46
PASTOR AL EBANKS .....	46
MS. MELANIE MCLAUGHLIN.....	46
PASTOR AL EBANKS .....	46
PASTOR SHIAN O’CONNOR.....	47
MS. MELANIE MCLAUGHLIN.....	47
HON. W. MCKEEVA BUSH .....	48
HON. ALDEN M. MCLAUGHLIN, JR. ....	48
HON. W. MCKEEVA BUSH .....	48
HON. ALDEN M. MCLAUGHLIN, JR. ....	48
PROFESSOR JEFFREY JOWELL, QC.....	48
HON. W. MCKEEVA BUSH .....	49
MS. THERESA PITCAIRN-LEWIS .....	50
PROFESSOR JEFFREY JOWELL, QC.....	50
MS. THERESA PITCAIRN-LEWIS .....	50
PROFESSOR JEFFREY JOWELL, QC.....	50
MR. WILL PINEAU .....	51
HON. W. MCKEEVA BUSH .....	52
MS. SARAH COLLINS .....	52
HON. W. MCKEEVA BUSH, .....	53
HON. ALDEN M. MCLAUGHLIN, JR. ....	53
HON. W. MCKEEVA BUSH .....	53
HON. ALDEN M. MCLAUGHLIN, JR. ....	54
HON. W. MCKEEVA BUSH .....	54
HON. D. KURT TIBBETTS.....	54
<b>PROTECTION OF CHILDREN .....</b>	<b>55</b>
HON. W. MCKEEVA BUSH .....	55
PROFESSOR JEFFREY JOWELL, QC.....	55
MS. THERESA PITCAIRN-LEWIS .....	56
PASTOR AL EBANKS .....	56
HON. ALDEN M. MCLAUGHLIN, JR. ....	56
MR. ROLSTON M. ANGLIN.....	57
PROFESSOR JEFFREY JOWELL, QC.....	58
<b>SECTION 18 .....</b>	<b>58</b>
HON. W. MCKEEVA BUSH .....	58

PROFESSOR JEFFREY JOWELL, QC.....	58
MS. JULIANNA Y. O’CONNOR-CONNOLLY,.....	59
HON. SAMUEL W. BULGIN, QC.....	59
PROFESSOR JEFFREY JOWELL, QC.....	60
<b>EDUCATION .....</b>	<b>60</b>
HON. ALDEN M. MCLAUGHLIN, JR. ....	61
HON. W. MCKEEVA BUSH .....	62
HON. ALDEN M. MCLAUGHLIN, JR. ....	62
MR. WILL PINEAU .....	63
HON. ALDEN M. MCLAUGHLIN, JR. ....	64
<b>PUBLIC EMERGENCIES .....</b>	<b>64</b>
PROFESSOR JEFFREY JOWELL, QC.....	64
<b>SECTION 21 .....</b>	<b>65</b>
HON. ALDEN M. MCLAUGHLIN, JR. ....	65
<b>INTERPRETIVE OBLIGATION.....</b>	<b>66</b>
PROFESSOR JEFFREY JOWELL, QC.....	66
<b>SECTION 24 .....</b>	<b>66</b>
PROFESSOR JEFFREY JOWELL, QC.....	67
HON. SAMUEL W. BULGIN, QC.....	68
PROFESSOR JEFFREY JOWELL, QC.....	68
<b>SECTION 26 .....</b>	<b>69</b>
HON. W. MCKEEVA BUSH .....	69
HON. ALDEN M. MCLAUGHLIN, JR.....	71
MS. MELANIE MCLAUGHLIN.....	72
MS. SARAH COLLINS .....	72
HON. W. MCKEEVA BUSH .....	72
MS. MELANIE MCLAUGHLIN.....	73
<b>PROPOSAL 22 .....</b>	<b>75</b>
HON. W. MCKEEVA BUSH .....	76
MS. JULIANNA Y. O’CONNOR-CONNOLLY .....	80
HON. ALDEN M. MCLAUGHLIN, JR. ....	81
MS. JULIANNA Y. O’CONNOR-CONNOLLY .....	82
HON. D. KURT TIBBETTS.....	82
MR. ROLSTON M. ANGLIN.....	83
HON. ALDEN M. MCLAUGHLIN, JR. ....	83
HON. W. MCKEEVA BUSH .....	84
<b>SECTION 23 .....</b>	<b>85</b>
HON. ALDEN M. MCLAUGHLIN, JR. ....	85

HON. D. KURT TIBBETTS, JP ..... 86

**CLOSING REMARKS ..... 89**

MR. ROLSTON M. ANGLIN..... 89

HON. W. MCKEEVA BUSH ..... 90

MR. WILL PINEAU ..... 91

PASTOR AL EBANKS ..... 92

PASTOR SHIAN O’CONNOR..... 92

HON. D. KURT TIBBETTS, JP ..... 92

THE CHAIRMAN (MR. IAN HENDRY, FCO DELEGATION):..... 96

**THURSDAY, 2 OCTOBER, 2008**  
**2008 CONSTITUTIONAL NEGOTIATIONS**  
**HELD BETWEEN**  
**CAYMAN ISLANDS DELEGATION AND**  
**THE FOREIGN AND COMMONWEALTH OFFICE**

**THE CHAIRMAN (MR. IAN HENDRY, FCO DELEGATION):** Good morning everybody. Before we start I'd like to invite Pastor Shian to say a prayer this morning.

**PRAYER**

**PASTOR SHIAN O'CONNOR (REPRESENTATIVE OF THE CAYMAN ISLANDS SEVENTH DAY ADVENTISTS CONFERENCE):** Let us bow our heads as we praise.

*Our Heavenly Father, we stand indebted to You this morning for Your faithfulness to us as You watched over us as we slept last night, You woke us up this morning, and You have given us yet another opportunity, a brand new day with opportunities and challenges. As we begin this session, this final day, we invoke Your presence here, we ask Your spirit will lead and guide that the goals and objectives that we have today will all be met with a successful session, and at the end we will return the honour and the glory to You. This is our prayer we pray in Jesus' name. Amen.*

**THE CHAIRMAN (MR. IAN HENDRY, FCO DELEGATION):** Thank you. Thank you very much.

**PROPOSAL 4 – BILL OF RIGHTS**

**THE CHAIRMAN (MR. IAN HENDRY, FCO DELEGATION):** Well, we've reached the last day of our deliberations of this particular round of discussions, and I think we're in pretty good shape to achieve my much desired objective to have a look at every point in the set of proposals before us.

I think, as I advertised yesterday afternoon, we should start with Bill of Rights, Proposal 4, and we have the benefit of a proposed draft Bill of Rights circulated on Monday. And I invite first the Cayman Islands delegation, if they would like to do so to say some introductory words about it. For our part we have a few questions about it, having studied



the draft, but I'll come to those after any introductory remarks anyone would like to make.

Alden?

**HON. ALDEN M. MCLAUGHLIN, JR. JP (MEMBER OF PPM, MINISTER OF EDUCATION, TRAINING, EMPLOYMENT, YOUTH, SPORTS & CULTURE):** Morning, Mr. Chairman, good morning everyone. I'm going to leave most of the technical discussion on this point to the professor, but I just want to say, by way of introduction, that I think we're all keenly conscious of the various concerns about the implications for a Bill of Rights for these Islands.

This has easily been the most controversial aspect of the whole constitutional modernisation initiative, and a great deal of work has been done on the education front, a great deal of time is spent in consultations both publicly and privately, with a wide range of stakeholders coming out of those discussions, or coming out of the education campaign really I think we now have a much better — as a country we must have a better grasp of what human rights is all about and particularly what a Bill of Rights should aim to achieve.

And the draft that we have prepared ... well, it's one of a number of drafts that we have gone — that we have developed, and we hope this reflects and meets the various objections, the concerns that we've heard first about the possible horizontal application of rights and that it meets the concerns raised by the CMA in particular in that regard, and the concerns about judicial activism or “judicial creep” that we hope that those have been met by the inclusion of a provision which provides that the courts will have the power to declare legislation as incompatible with the Bill of Rights rather than to strike the legislation down outright. Those were the two principal concerns raised, I believe, by most stakeholders in this regard. So, I am hopeful that with continued discussion today and with observations from the FCO team, and obviously everybody else around the table, that we'll be able to come to an agreement about the wording of the Bill of Rights and that we'd be able to leave here being able to say to the country that there is a draft Bill of Rights which we believe the whole country can get behind.

Thank you, sir.

**PROFESSOR JEFFREY JOWELL, QC (CONSULTANT TO CAYMAN ISLANDS GOVERNMENT FOR CONSTITUTIONAL MODERNISATION INITIATIVE):** If I just may add to that. The — on the technical side the draft Bill of Rights is based on the 2003 Draft, with a number of amendments and additions and simplifications.

Yesterday you mentioned the desirability of plain English, and of course, that is very desirable, but you also mentioned quite rightly that in order to leave no room for doubt and to be clear about the scope of a Bill of Rights things often have to get rather convoluted and complicated.

















































































































































































































